



Government  
Actuary's  
Department

# Transitional Protection Remedy: Analysis to Support the Equalities Impact Assessment (Preliminary) Firefighters' Pension Schemes (Scotland)

***DRAFT - November 2021***

This report is labelled 'Preliminary' because it assesses only the impact of the 'Prospective Remedy Phase' of the Transitional Protection Remedy. The Prospective Remedy Phase relates to the policy decision to close all legacy schemes to future accrual with effect from 1 April 2022.

A further version of this report, which also covers the impact of the 'Retrospective Remedy Phase' where all members will be provided with a choice of benefits over the remedy period, will follow in due course.

# Contents

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <b>1. Introduction</b> .....  | <b>3</b>  |
| <b>2. Approach to Assessment</b> .....                                    | <b>6</b>  |
| <b>3. Equality Impact Analysis: Age</b> .....                             | <b>9</b>  |
| <b>4. Equality Impact Analysis: Sex</b> .....                             | <b>12</b> |
| <b>5. Equality Impact Analysis: Other Protected Characteristics</b> ..... | <b>18</b> |
| <b>Appendix A: Data and Assumptions</b> .....                             | <b>20</b> |
| <b>Appendix B: Compliance and limitations</b> .....                       | <b>21</b> |

DRAFT

# 1. Introduction

## Purpose

- 1.1. This report is addressed to, and has been prepared at the request of, the Scottish Public Pensions Agency ('SPPA').
- 1.2. The Public Sector Equality Duty ('PSED') was created by the Equality Act 2010 and is supported by the specific duties contained in the Equality Act 2010 (Specific Duties) (Scotland) Regulations 2012, as amended.
- 1.3. The PSED requires the Scottish Government to assess the impact of applying a proposed new, or revised, policy or practice. Scottish Ministers must have 'due regard' to the need to eliminate discrimination, advance equality of opportunity and foster good relations between people with different protected characteristics when carrying out their activities.
- 1.4. There are nine protected characteristics identified in the Equality Act 2010: (1) sex, (2) age, (3) disability, (4) race, (5) religion or belief, (6) gender reassignment, (7) pregnancy and maternity, (8) sexual orientation, (9) marital or civil partnership status.
- 1.5. **The purpose of this report is to provide analysis, specifically in relation to the Firefighters' Pension Schemes (Scotland)<sup>1</sup>, to support SPPA who are acting on behalf of Scottish Ministers, in considering the impact of the policy decision to close all legacy schemes to future accrual with effect from 1 April 2022.**
- 1.6. This is one aspect of the proposed approach to address the age discrimination identified in the 2015 public service pension reforms, referred to as 'Transitional Protection Remedy', or 'McCloud remedy'. A further report will follow in due course, which also covers the policy decision to provide eligible members with a choice of legacy or reformed scheme benefits over the remedy period.

## Background

- 1.7. When public service pension reforms were introduced in 2015, the UK Government agreed to allow those closest to their retirement age to stay in their legacy schemes. These arrangements were referred to as transitional protection arrangements.

---

<sup>1</sup> For the Firefighters' Pension Schemes (Scotland), the legacy schemes are the 1992 Scheme, the 2006 Scheme (Standard) and the 2006 Scheme (Special), and the reformed scheme is the 2015 Scheme.

- 1.8. For the Firefighters' Pension Schemes (Scotland), this meant:
- A. Active members who, on 1 April 2012, were in the 1992 Scheme and aged 45 or over (or were aged 40 or over and had at least 20 years of service) would remain in the 1992 Scheme.
  - B. Active members who, on 1 April 2012, were in the 2006 Scheme and aged 50 or over would remain in the 2006 Scheme.
  - C. Active members who, as of 1 April 2012, were in one of the pre-2015 schemes and were within 4 years of qualifying for full protection have limited protection so that, on average, for every month closer to qualifying for full protection, they gain about 53 days of protection in their then current scheme. At the end of their protected period they transferred into the 2015 Scheme.
- 1.9. In this report, members in categories A and B above are referred to as 'Protected' members and members in category C are referred to as 'Tapered Protected' members.
- 1.10. Following a challenge in the Courts, however, it was found that such transitional arrangements were discriminatory on the grounds of age and, for certain schemes, gave rise to indirect sex and race discrimination.
- 1.11. To address the discrimination identified, it was announced that:
- In relation to service from 1 April 2015 to 31 March 2022 (known as the 'remedy period'), all eligible members will have a choice between:
    - legacy scheme benefits (i.e. benefits in the 1992 Scheme or 2006 Schemes in Firefighters' Pension Schemes (Scotland))
    - or
    - benefits equivalent to those available under the reformed scheme (benefits in the 2015 Scheme in Firefighters' Pension Schemes (Scotland))
  - There will not be an option to have a combination of benefits in the legacy scheme and the reformed scheme over the remedy period.
  - Eligible members were defined as those who were in service on or before 31 March 2012 and still in service on or after 1 April 2015. This includes members who are currently active, deferred or retired and those with a non-disqualifying break in service of no more than five years.
  - Members will be able to make their choice at the point at which they will receive their scheme benefits. Where a member's benefits are already in payment, the choice will be offered as soon as practicable.
  - From 1 April 2022, all members will accrue benefits in their reformed scheme, regardless of age. There will be no further benefits accrued in the legacy schemes from this point.

- 1.12. The [Public Service Pensions and Judicial Offices Bill](#) is the legislative vehicle that sets out the provisions that give effect to the above announcements and it will apply across all schemes in the UK in relation to the Transitional Protection Remedy. This is currently progressing through the UK Parliament. The Equality Impact Assessment ('EqIA') carried out alongside this Bill can be found at the link above.
- 1.13. Scottish Ministers are responsible for making the secondary legislation to amend the Firefighters' Pension Schemes (Scotland). This secondary legislation will be delivered in two phases:
  - A. *Prospective remedy phase (due to be in force for 1 April 2022):*
    - Legacy schemes will close on 31 March 2022 and all members who continue in pensionable service from 1 April 2022 will do so as members of the 2015 Scheme.
  - B. *Retrospective remedy phase (planned for Autumn 2022):*
    - From 2022, eligible members will be able to choose to receive legacy pension scheme benefits or benefits equivalent to those available under the reformed pension scheme for service between 2015 and 2022.

## Policy to be assessed

- 1.14. **This Preliminary report is intended to support consideration of the impact of the Prospective Remedy Phase (as noted in 1.13 above) but will be updated in due course to consider both the prospective and retrospective remedy phases of the secondary legislation.**
- 1.15. Further information on our approach to assessing this is provided in chapter 2.

## Next steps

- 1.16. Chapters 3-5 consider the potential impact of the proposed measures by reference to the protected characteristics identified in the Equality Act 2010.
- 1.17. We have included commentary on the analysis of the data, which SPPA may wish to use in the preparation of its EqIA. However, it is important to note that **it is for SPPA, acting on behalf of Scottish Ministers, to review this analysis and ultimately determine their view of the assessment of the equalities impact** i.e. have 'due regard' as to whether the policy treats someone less favourably due to a protected characteristic.
- 1.18. We very much welcome input into how to refine this initial analysis, by contributing further perspectives or identifying where there might be additional equality impacts to consider.

## 2. Approach to Assessment

We have set out below the information we will use as a basis for examining the protected characteristics.

### Closing legacy schemes with effect from 1 April 2022

- 2.1. In this report, we have examined the impact of this policy decision on Protected members only. Under the Transitional Protection Remedy, Protected members will now be moved into the 2015 Scheme from 1 April 2022, whereas these members previously had an expectation from the 2015 reforms of continuing in their legacy arrangement after 1 April 2022. In all circumstances, Tapered Protected and unprotected members were due to accrue benefits in the 2015 Scheme from 1 April 2022.
- 2.2. The 'final salary' link and weighted accrual elements (where relevant) of the legacy schemes will be protected for all former legacy scheme members.
- 2.3. For the avoidance of doubt, closing legacy schemes to future accrual with effect from 1 April 2022 will only impact Protected members **who are still accruing benefits as at 1 April 2022**. Given that most Protected members will have reached normal pension age (age 55 in the 1992 Scheme and age 60 in the 2006 Scheme) or accrued a full 1992 Scheme pension on or before 31 March 2022, it is likely that the vast majority of Protected members will have retired by that point.
- 2.4. At this stage, we are not able to provide the number and characteristics of the Protected members who may still be accruing benefits as at 1 April 2022.
- 2.5. Therefore, as outlined below, we have used the most recent data available to us to consider the impact of the UK Government's policy decision to close legacy schemes to future accrual with effect from 1 April 2022.
- 2.6. It is also worth highlighting that further consideration is being given to the approach to take in relation to members who request to retire due to ill-health ahead of 31 March 2022, but where this is not granted until after 1 April 2022. We have not analysed this situation specifically in this document, but it may be worth reassessing the protected characteristic of disability further once the approach has been clarified.

## Data used

- 2.7. The most recent data available to the Government Actuary's Department (GAD) is that provided to GAD by SPPA for the purposes of the 31 March 2016 actuarial valuation.
- 2.8. The data to be used for the next actuarial valuation, as at 31 March 2020, has not yet been finalised but we can update our assessment to reflect more recent data if and where it becomes available.
- 2.9. The table below sets out the number of Protected members as at 31 March 2016:

|  | 1992 Scheme | 2006 Scheme (Standard) | 2006 Scheme (Special) | Total        |
|--|-------------|------------------------|-----------------------|--------------|
| Protected members in service as at 31 March 2016       | 1,098       | 113                    | 203                   | <b>1,414</b> |
| <i>Proportion of total number of Protected members</i> | 78%         | 8%                     | 14%                   |              |

- 2.10. We have also shown below the total number of active members in the Scheme as at 31 March 2016:

|   |                                  | Number of members | Proportion of the membership (based on number of members) |
|---|----------------------------------|-------------------|---|
| Eligible for Transitional Protection remedy     | <i>Protected members</i>         | 1,414             | 25%   |
|   | <i>Tapered Protected members</i> | 810               | 15%   |
|   | <i>Unprotected members</i>       | 2,644             | 47%   |
|   | <b>Total</b>                     | <b>4,868</b>      | <b>87%</b>  |
| Not eligible for Transitional Protection remedy |                                  | <b>712</b>        | <b>13%</b>  |
| <b>Total</b>                                    |                                  | <b>5,580</b>      | <b>100%</b>   |

- 2.11. The table above shows that 25% of the active membership of the scheme as at 31 March 2016 were Protected members.
- 2.12. We acknowledge that this data is at a date which does not reflect the specific point in time at which the measure will come into place. As noted in 2.3, we expect that most of the Protected members identified as at 31 March 2016 will have retired by 1 April 2022, such that much less than 25% of the active scheme members at that date are, in reality, impacted. However, since we cannot be sure which Protected members will remain in active service at 1 April 2022, we consider it is appropriate to use this data for this equality analysis, particularly as there is currently no alternative.

- 2.13. Data on sex and age (and service, role, part-time status) of the membership of the Firefighters' Pension Schemes (Scotland) was provided to GAD by SPPA for the purposes of the 31 March 2016 actuarial valuation.
- 2.14. For the other protected characteristics under the Equality Act 2010, SPPA does not hold complete or up-to-date data. However, data for the whole of the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service workforce is available and has been used. Given the current participation rate in the Firefighters' Pension Schemes (Scotland) is currently of the order of 97% (Source: SPPA), this represents a reasonable approximation to the membership of the Scheme.

DRAFT



## 3. Equality Impact Analysis: Age

This Chapter sets out our analysis of the equality impacts of the policy decision to close the legacy schemes to future accrual with effect from 1 April 2022 on the protected characteristic of age as identified in the Equality Act 2010.

### Closing legacy schemes with effect from 1 April 2022

#### *Introduction*

- 3.1. As previously outlined, the Courts determined that the transitional protection element of the 2015 public service pension scheme reforms treated those members who were closest to retirement more favourably than younger members, and this amounted to direct age discrimination.
- 3.2. The UK Government's policy decision to no longer permit Protected members to accrue benefits in the legacy schemes after 31 March 2022 is one aspect of the approach that is to be taken to address the age discrimination identified. All Tapered Protected and unprotected members would be accruing benefits in the reformed scheme by this point, so this decision only impacts Protected members.
- 3.3. Given this policy decision only impacts Protected members, it is to be expected that those affected will be older than the general scheme population. However, this is deemed necessary to remove the age discrimination that had previously been identified, and to ensure that all members are treated equitably from this date.

#### *Analysis: Age*

- 3.4. The following table sets out the age profile of all active members in the Firefighters' Pension Schemes (Scotland), as well as the age profile of the Protected members only, as at 31 March 2016:

| Age as at 31 March 2016 | Active Membership as at 31 March 2016 | Membership with Full Protection as at 31 March 2016 |
|-------------------------|---------------------------------------|---|
| <b>16-19</b>            | -                                     | -   |
| <b>20-24</b>            | <b>3%</b>                             | -   |
| <b>25-29</b>            | <b>7%</b>                             | -   |
| <b>30-34</b>            | <b>11%</b>                            | -   |
| <b>35-39</b>            | <b>16%</b>                            | -   |
| <b>40-44</b>            | <b>18%</b>                            | -   |
| <b>45-49</b>            | <b>24%</b>                            | 27%   |
| <b>50-54</b>            | <b>18%</b>                            | 56%   |
| <b>55-59</b>            | <b>3%</b>                             | 13%   |
| <b>60 and above</b>     | <b>1%</b>                             | 3%  |
| <b>Total</b>            | <b>5,580</b>                          | <b>1,414</b>  |

3.5. The following table sets out which scheme the 1,414 Protected members as at 31 March 2016, within each age group, are accruing benefits in:

| Age                 | Percentage in 1992 Scheme | Percentage in 2006 Scheme (Standard) | Percentage in 2006 Scheme (Special) | Total      |
|---------------------|---------------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|------------|
| <b>45-49</b>        | 97%                       | 3%                                   | -                                   | <b>27%</b> |
| <b>50-54</b>        | 82%                       | 15%                                  | 2%                                  | <b>56%</b> |
| <b>55-59</b>        | 36%                       | 27%                                  | 38%                                 | <b>13%</b> |
| <b>60 and above</b> | 2%                        | 43%                                  | 55%                                 | <b>3%</b>  |

To be clear, the total percentage shown represents the percentage of the 1,414 fully Protected members as at 31 March 2016 who fall within that age range. The percentages shown under the 1992 and 2006 Schemes' columns represent the percentage of fully Protected members in that age group within the respective schemes.

3.6. This analysis identifies that:

- As expected, Protected members are older than the general scheme population.
- Most Protected members are between ages 50 and 54 as at 31 March 2016.
- At this age range of 50-54, the majority of Protected members are accruing benefits in the 1992 scheme. Again, this is as expected as it is consistent with the average entry age of members into the Firefighters' Pension Schemes (Scotland) and the opening date of the 2006 Scheme being more recent.

3.7. **Commentary on analysis:**

*As illustrated above, Protected members are older than the general active member population. Continuing to provide Protected members with access to the legacy schemes beyond 31 March 2022 would discriminate against younger members who are not offered these terms.*

*Therefore, applying a policy that removes the provision of favourable treatment to older members compared with others in the scheme is deemed necessary.*

DRAFT

## 4. Equality Impact Analysis: Sex

This Chapter sets out our analysis of the equality impacts of the policy decision to close the legacy schemes to future accrual with effect from 1 April 2022 on the protected characteristic of sex as identified in the Equality Act 2010.

### Closing legacy schemes with effect from 1 April 2022

#### Introduction

- 4.1. In determining that the transitional protection arrangements discriminated on the grounds of age, the Courts also concluded that if older members in a scheme were more likely to be male, providing older members with preferential terms amounted to indirect sex discrimination.
- 4.2. The policy decision to no longer permit Protected members to accrue benefits in the legacy schemes after 1 April 2022 is one aspect of addressing the age discrimination identified and, in turn, the indirect sex discrimination where it too applies.
- 4.3. We have analysed below the split of the Protected members by sex <sup>2</sup>.

#### Analysis: Sex

- 4.4. The following table sets out the sex profile of the members in the Firefighters' Pension Schemes (Scotland), as well as the sex profile of the Protected members:

|                | Active Membership as at<br>31 March 2016 | Protected members as at<br>31 March 2016 |
|----------------|--|--|
| <b>Males</b>   | 95%                                      | 99% (1,401)                              |
| <b>Females</b> | 5%                                       | 1% (13)                                  |
| <b>Total</b>   | <b>5,580</b>                             | <b>1,414</b>                             |

- 4.5. This analysis identifies that:
  - The percentage of the Protected members who are male is greater than the percentage of the overall scheme population who are male.

<sup>2</sup> The Equality Act 2010 lists 'sex' as a protected characteristic. Data for the Firefighters' Pension Schemes (Scotland) is available by sex. However, it is important to note that sex and gender are two different concepts. A person's gender identity is not always the same as the sex assigned to them at birth, and some people may not identify as having a gender or as non-binary. Gender reassignment is also a protected characteristic under the Equality Act 2010, and this is examined in Section 5.

- 4.6. The following table sets out the percentage of male and female Protected members in each scheme as at 31 March 2016:

|                | 1992 Scheme  | 2006 Scheme (Standard) | 2006 Scheme (Special) | All Protected Members |
|----------------|--------------|------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| <b>Males</b>   | 99% (1,088)  | 99% (112)              | 99% (201)             | <b>99%</b>            |
| <b>Females</b> | 1% (10)      | 1% (1)                 | 1% (2)                | <b>1%</b>             |
| <b>Total</b>   | <b>1,098</b> | <b>113</b>             | <b>203</b>            | <b>1,414</b>          |

- 4.7. This analysis identifies that:

- The percentage of Protected members who are males and accruing benefits in all legacy schemes mirrors the overall percentage of Protected members.

- 4.8. **Commentary on analysis:**

*Based on the analysis above, Protected members are more likely to be male. Continuing to provide Protected members with access to the legacy schemes beyond 31 March 2022 could be deemed to be indirect sex discrimination.*

*However, the policy decision to no longer permit Protected members to accrue benefits in the legacy schemes after 31 March 2022 aims to remove this indirect sex discrimination.*

**Analysis: Sex and Age**

- 4.9. We have also set out below the percentage of males in both the overall scheme population and the Protected members population at each age range:

| Age as at 31 March 2016 | Active Membership as at 31 March 2016 | Membership with Protection as at 31 March 2016 |
|-------------------------|---------------------------------------|--|
| <b>20-24</b>            | 93%                                   | -  |
| <b>25-29</b>            | 93%                                   | -  |
| <b>30-34</b>            | 94%                                   | -  |
| <b>35-39</b>            | 92%                                   | -  |
| <b>40-44</b>            | 92%                                   | 100%   |
| <b>45-49</b>            | 96%                                   | 99%  |
| <b>50-54</b>            | 98%                                   | 99%  |
| <b>55-59</b>            | 100%                                  | 100%   |
| <b>60 and above</b>     | 98%                                   | 98%  |

4.10. This analysis identifies that:

- The percentage of the active member population that is male is slightly greater at older ages. Accordingly, the overall percentage of Protected members who are male is higher than seen in the overall scheme population.
- The percentage of Protected members who are males is higher than the overall scheme population at the relevant ages.

4.11. Commentary on analysis:

*The above analysis supports the comments in 4.8 that Protected members are more likely to be male.*

**Analysis: Sex and Firefighter role**

4.12. Moving from a final salary legacy scheme to a career average reformed scheme for future accrual decreases the added benefit of late career pay progression for higher earners.

4.13. This means that the policy decision to no longer permit Protected members to accrue benefits in the legacy schemes from 1 April 2022 is likely to have a negative impact on those who, in future years, achieve higher salary progression, rather than those with lower salary progression.

4.14. However, it is worth noting that the impact of this is likely to be limited given that:

- For Protected members who continue accruing benefits beyond 31 March 2022, their benefits in the legacy scheme will be calculated based on their 'final salary' when they leave the Scheme, rather than as at 31 March 2022.
- It would seem unlikely many Protected members would experience significant pay progression after 31 March 2022, given how close they are to their retirement age.

4.15. Across the UK's public service pension schemes, a larger proportion of males reach higher salary bands than females, and therefore, of those who may be negatively impacted by this policy decision, a higher proportion will be male.

4.16. We have set out below the split by role of members in the overall active member population and the Protected members' population as at 31 March 2016.

| Role as at 31 March 2016   | Active membership as at 31 March 2016 | % of overall active membership | Protected members as at 31 March 2016 | % of Protected membership ** |
|----------------------------|---------------------------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------|------------------------------|
| Firefighter                | 4,621                                 | 83%                            | 895                                   | 63%                          |
| Crew Manager               | 492                                   | 9%                             | 217                                   | 15%                          |
| Watch Manager              | 263                                   | 5%                             | 171                                   | 12%                          |
| Station Manager            | 106                                   | 2%                             | 67                                    | 5%                           |
| Group Manager              | 38                                    | 1%                             | 28                                    | 2%                           |
| Area Manager A             | 11                                    | -                              | 9                                     | 1%                           |
| Area Manager B             | 23                                    | -                              | 12                                    | 1%                           |
| Asst/ Deputy Chief Officer | 5                                     | -                              | 5                                     | -                            |
| Chief Fire Officer         | 3                                     | -                              | 2                                     | -                            |
| Unknown                    | 18                                    | -                              | 8                                     | -                            |
| <b>Total</b>               | <b>5,580</b>                          |                                | <b>1,414</b>                          |                              |

\*\* Percentages shown are to the nearest 1%. Therefore, percentages which are less than 0.5% have not been shown above, but it is noted that excluding these may mean the percentages do not sum to 100%.

4.17. This analysis identifies that:

- The highest proportion of all active members and Protected members are Firefighters.

4.18. We have then provided below the proportion of the membership at each role (that has been identified) that is male in both populations.

| Rank as at 31 March 2016   | Active membership as at 31 March 2016 | Protected members as at 31 March 2016 |
|----------------------------|---------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| Firefighter                | 94%                                   | 99%                                   |
| Crew Manager               | 97%                                   | 99%                                   |
| Watch Manager              | 96%                                   | 99%                                   |
| Station Manager            | 99%                                   | 100%                                  |
| Group Manager              | 97%                                   | 100%                                  |
| Area Manager A             | 100%                                  | 100%                                  |
| Area Manager B             | 95%                                   | 91%                                   |
| Asst/ Deputy Chief Officer | 100%                                  | 100%                                  |
| Chief Fire Officer         | 100%                                  | 100%                                  |

4.19. This analysis identifies that:

- In the overall active scheme membership, males form a higher proportion of the higher earning roles than that for lower earning roles.
- Given that there are so few protected females, almost all of the protected members are male across all of the roles.

4.20. **Commentary on analysis:**

*There has been some suggestion that higher earning Protected members are more impacted by the policy decision to no longer permit Protected members to accrue benefits in the legacy schemes after 31 March 2022.*

*The above analysis highlights that almost all of the Protected members are male, regardless of earnings.*

*There appears to be limited evidence to suggest that this remedy could be seen as having a greater effect on males. Considered in the context of the pension schemes in their entirety however, the measure is necessary to remove the discrimination identified in the McCloud judgement and any impact within the protected members category is objectively justifiable.*

#### **Analysis: Sex and Employment Status**

4.21. In Scotland, women are more likely to work part-time than men.<sup>3</sup> It is therefore worth considering the equalities impact of those who work part-time within this protected characteristic.

4.22. The analysis below provides a split of the scheme membership into those working part-time (including retained firefighters) and those who work full-time.

|                    | Active membership as at<br>31 March 2016 | All Protected members<br>as at 31 March 2016 |
|--------------------|--|--|
| <b>Full-time</b>   | 76%                                      | 97% (1,365)                                  |
| <b>Part-time *</b> | 24%                                      | 3% (49)                                      |
| <b>Total</b>       | <b>5,580</b>                             | <b>1,414</b>                                 |

\* This includes retained Firefighters

4.23. Of those 49 Protected members working part-time as at 31 March 2016:

- All are male.
- None are accruing benefits in the 1992 Scheme; 26 are accruing benefits in the 2006 Scheme (Standard) and 23 are accruing benefits in the 2006 Scheme (Special).

<sup>3</sup> <https://www.closesthegap.org.uk/content/gap-statistics/>



4.24. This analysis identifies that:

- As at 31 March 2016, the percentage of the Protected members working part-time was **lower** than the percentage of the overall scheme population working part-time.
- Of those Protected members working part-time, the percentage that are female (0%) is not vastly different to the percentage of the Protected member population that is female (1%).

4.25. **Commentary on analysis:**

*Based on the above analysis, Protected members are less likely to work part-time. This was to be expected since Protected members are older and part-time working has become more common in recent years, particularly in the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service.*

*Males are shown to make up all the part-time Protected members. Therefore, we have not identified any disproportionate impacts of the policy on this group.*

## 5. Equality Impact Analysis: Other Protected Characteristics

**This Chapter sets out our analysis of the equality impacts of the policy decision to close the legacy schemes to future accrual with effect from 1 April 2022 on the other protected characteristics as identified in the Equality Act 2010.**

- 5.1. SPPA does not hold complete or up-to-date data on the other protected characteristics under the Equality Act 2010.
- 5.2. For the remaining protected characteristics, where possible, we have used data for the Scottish Fire and Rescue Authority as a whole. This seemed a reasonable approximation given the scheme participation of the workforce is currently of the order of 97% (Source: SPPA). It should be noted that a sizeable proportion of the population chose not to provide personal information, so the number of firefighters with the relevant protected characteristics may be underreported.
- 5.3. We have used information in the following sources to comment on the protected characteristics of disability and race/ethnicity:
  - See page x for information over the year 2011-2012:  
[4\\_20130425b.cp.01\\_13\\_publicsectorequalityduty.pdf \(firescotland.gov.uk\)](#)
  - See page 8 for information as at 2021:  
[equalpaygenderpaygapreport2021\\_v2.pdf \(firescotland.gov.uk\)](#)
- 5.4. The proposed changes will apply to all members regardless of these protected characteristics. However, we have considered the potential impact of these individually below.

### Disability

- 5.5. The proportion of firefighters reporting a disability has increased very slightly over time. For example, over the year 2011-2012, the percentage of firefighters where a disability has been advised was 0.6%, and this was 0.8% in 2021.
- 5.6. This might suggest that Protected members (who must have joined before 1 April 2012) are less likely to have a disability compared with the overall scheme population.

## Race/Ethnicity

- 5.7. The proportion of firefighters from ethnic minority groups has increased only very marginally between 2011-2012 and 2021 (0.6% to 0.7%).
- 5.8. This might suggest that Protected members are no more likely to be from ethnic minority groups compared with the overall scheme population.

## Religion or Belief

- 5.9. Available data on this protected characteristic in relation to the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service workforce or the Firefighters' Pension Schemes (Scotland) membership. Although there is limited data available, if new data indicates that this group may suffer disproportionate adverse effects we will consider the impact further.

## Gender reassignment

- 5.10. Available data on this protected characteristic in relation to the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service workforce or the Firefighters' Pension Schemes (Scotland) membership. Although there is limited data available, if new data indicates that this group may suffer disproportionate adverse effects we will consider the impact further.

## Pregnancy and maternity

- 5.11. Available data on this protected characteristic in relation to the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service workforce or the Firefighters' Pension Schemes (Scotland) membership. Although there is limited data available, if new data indicates that this group may suffer disproportionate adverse effects we will consider the impact further.

## Sexual orientation

- 5.12. Available data on this protected characteristic in relation to the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service workforce or the Firefighters' Pension Schemes (Scotland) membership. Although there is limited data available, if new data indicates that this group may suffer disproportionate adverse effects we will consider the impact further.

## Marriage and civil partnership

- 5.13. Available data on this protected characteristic in relation to the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service workforce or the Firefighters' Pension Schemes (Scotland) membership. Although there is limited data available, if new data indicates that this group may suffer disproportionate adverse effects we will consider the impact further.

# Appendix A: Data and Assumptions

## Data

- The analysis in this report is based on the data provided by SPPA to GAD for the 2016 actuarial valuation, as detailed in our note [“Firefighters’ Pension Schemes \(Scotland\) - Actuarial valuation as at 31 March 2016: Report on membership data”](#) of 28 February 2019.
- Whilst comprehensive data was received from SPPA for the 2016 valuation, some aspects of the data were incomplete and/or unreliable for certain elements of our valuation calculations. It was not possible to fully resolve those data issues in the timescale required for the valuation and, therefore, assumptions were required in respect of incomplete and/or unreliable individual member records. Further information on the steps taken to address data issues can be found in the above report.
- Please note that a member has been classed as ‘full-time’ if the part-time proportion provided by SPPA for the purposes of the 31 March 2016 actuarial valuation, was recorded as 1 or 100%. All other members have been assumed to be part-time. Please note that rigorous checks were not carried out on the part-time proportions provided.

## Appendix B: Compliance and limitations

- This report is intended for the use of the Scottish Public Pensions Agency ('SPPA') for the purposes of analysing the potential impact of the Transitional Protection Remedy. The information and advice in this report should not be relied upon, or assumed to be appropriate, for any other purpose or by any other person. GAD does not accept any liability to third parties, whether or not GAD has agreed to the disclosure of its advice to the third party.
- This report has been carried out in accordance with the applicable Technical Actuarial Standard: TAS 100 issued by the Financial Reporting Council (FRC). The FRC sets technical standards for actuarial work in the UK.

DRAFT